

# Module 4: Metric Spaces and Sequences II

## Operational math bootcamp



Statistical Sciences  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

Emma Kroell

University of Toronto

July 15, 2022

# Outline

- Sequences
  - Cauchy sequences
  - subsequences
- Continuous functions
  - Contractions
- Equivalence of metrics

# Sequences

## Definition (Sequence)

Let  $(X, d)$  be a metric space. A *sequence* is an ordered list of points  $x_n$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , in  $X$ , denoted  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ . We say that a sequence  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  *converges* to a point  $x \in X$  if

$$\forall \varepsilon > 0 \quad \exists n_\varepsilon \in \mathbb{N} \quad \text{s.t.} \quad \underline{d(x_n, x) < \varepsilon} \quad \text{for all } n \geq n_\varepsilon$$

$$\bar{A} := \{x \in X : \forall \varepsilon > 0 \ B_\varepsilon(x) \cap A \neq \emptyset\}$$

## Proposition

Let  $(X, d)$  be a metric space, and let  $A \subseteq X$ . Then  $\bar{A}$  is equal to the set of points in  $X$  which are limits of a sequence in  $A$ .

## Proof.

$\Rightarrow$  Let  $x \in \bar{A}$ . Then by definition, for every  $\varepsilon > 0$ ,  $B_\varepsilon(x) \cap A \neq \emptyset$ . In particular, this is true for  $\varepsilon = 1/n, n \in \mathbb{N}$ .

For any  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , we can choose  $x_n \in A$  s.t.  $x_n \in B_{1/n}(x)$ , which means  $d(x, x_n) < 1/n$ . Since  $1/n \downarrow 0$  monotonically,  $x_n \rightarrow x$ . □

## Proof continued

⊆ Let  $x \in X$  be the limit of a sequence  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  in  $A$ .  
For every  $\varepsilon > 0$ ,  $\exists n_\varepsilon \in \mathbb{N}$  s.t.  $d(x_n, x) < \varepsilon \forall n \geq n_\varepsilon$ .  
 $\Rightarrow$  For every  $\varepsilon > 0$ ,  $\exists x_n \in A$  s.t.  $x_n \in B_\varepsilon(x)$ .  
 $\therefore \forall \varepsilon > 0, A \cap B_\varepsilon(x) \neq \emptyset$ . We conclude  
 $x \in \overline{A}$ .

## Corollary

A set  $F \subseteq X$ , where  $(X, d)$  is a metric space, is closed if and only if every sequence in  $F$  which converges in  $X$  converges to a point in  $F$ .

$$A \subseteq X \text{ is closed} \iff A = \overline{A}$$

# Cluster points of a set

## Definition

Let  $(X, d)$  be a metric space and  $A \subseteq X$ . A point  $x \in X$  is a *cluster point* of  $A$  (also called accumulation point) if for every  $\epsilon > 0$ ,  $B_\epsilon(x)$  contains ~~uncountably~~ <sup>infinitely</sup> many points in  $A$ .

## Proposition

$x \in X$  is a cluster point of  $A \subseteq X$  where  $(X, d)$  is a metric space if and only if there exists a sequence of points  $x_n \in A$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , such that  $x_n \rightarrow x$ .

## Proof.

( $\Rightarrow$ ) Suppose  $\exists$  sequence  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  in  $A$  s.t.  $x_n \rightarrow x$ .  
Then  $\forall \varepsilon > 0$ ,  $B_\varepsilon(x)$  contains infinitely many elements of the sequence  $x_n$ . Since each  $x_n \in A$ ,  $x$  is a cluster point of  $A$ .

( $\Leftarrow$ ) Suppose  $x$  is a cluster point of  $A$ . Then for any  $\varepsilon > 0$ ,  $\exists x_\varepsilon \in A$  s.t.  $x_\varepsilon \in B_\varepsilon(x)$ .  
Take  $\varepsilon = 1/n$ .  $\exists x_n \in A$  s.t.  $x_n \in B_{1/n}(x)$  □

By construction,  $x_n \rightarrow x$ .

Combining the previous result with the limit characterization of closure gives the following:

### Corollary

For  $A \subseteq X$ ,  $(X, d)$  a metric space, we have

$$\bar{A} = A \cup \{x \in X : x \text{ is a cluster point of } A\}.$$



# Cauchy sequences

## Definition (Cauchy sequence)

Let  $(X, d)$  be a metric space. A sequence denoted  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}} \in X$  is called a *Cauchy sequence* if

$$\forall \varepsilon > 0 \exists n_\varepsilon \in \mathbb{N} \text{ s.t. } d(x_n, x_m) < \varepsilon \text{ for all } n, m \geq n_\varepsilon$$

## Proposition

Let  $(X, d)$  be a metric space, and let  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a convergent sequence in  $X$ . Then  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  is Cauchy.

## Proof.

Let  $\varepsilon > 0$ . Let  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a convergent sequence in  $X$ . <sup>converging to  $x \in X$</sup>  Then there exists  $n_\varepsilon \in \mathbb{N}$  s.t.

$$d(x, x_n) < \varepsilon/2 \quad \forall n \geq n_\varepsilon.$$

Let  $n, m \geq n_\varepsilon$ , by triangle inequality,

$$d(x_n, x_m) \leq d(x_n, x) + d(x, x_m) < \varepsilon/2 + \varepsilon/2 = \varepsilon \quad \square$$

$\therefore (x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  is Cauchy

## Definition

A metric space where every Cauchy sequence converges (to a point in the space) is called *complete*.

$\mathbb{R}$ ,  $\mathbb{R}^n$  with usual metrics, are complete

## Proposition

Let  $(X, d)$  be a metric space, and let  $Y \subseteq X$ .

- (i) If  $X$  is complete and if  $Y$  is closed in  $X$ , then  $Y$  is complete.
- (ii) If  $Y$  is complete, then it is closed in  $X$ .

## Proof.

(i) Let  $X$  be a complete metric space. Let  $Y \subseteq X$  be closed. Let  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a Cauchy sequence in  $Y$ . Since  $Y \subseteq X$ ,  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  is a Cauchy sequence in  $X$ .  
 $\therefore (x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  converges to  $x \in X$  since  $X$  is complete.  
Since  $Y$  is closed, we must have  $x \in Y$ .

$\therefore Y$  is complete

(ii)  $(X, d)$  metric space,  $Y \subseteq X$  is complete.

Let  $(y_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a sequence in  $Y$  that converges to  $y \in X$ .  $(y_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  is Cauchy in  $X$  (and also in  $Y$ ). Since  $Y$  is complete,  $(y_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  converges to  $y' \in Y$ . Since sequences in metric spaces

converge to unique point,  $y = y'$ .  $\therefore Y$  is closed. □

# Subsequences

## Definition

Let  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a sequence in a metric space  $(X, d)$ . Let  $(n_k)_{k \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a sequence of natural numbers with  $n_1 < n_2 < \dots$ . The sequence  $(x_{n_k})_{k \in \mathbb{N}}$  is called a *subsequence* of  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ . If  $(x_{n_k})_{k \in \mathbb{N}}$  converges to  $x \in X$ , we call  $x$  a *subsequential limit*.

## Example

$$((-1)^n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}} = \{-1, 1, -1, 1, \dots\}$$

This sequence diverges. The subsequences  $((-1)^{2n})_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  and  $((-1)^{2n-1})_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  converge to 1 and -1, respectively.

## Proposition

A sequence  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  in a metric space  $(X, d)$  converges to  $x \in X$  if and only if every subsequence of  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  also converges to  $x$ .

## Proof.

( $\Leftarrow$ ) Suppose every subsequence of  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  converges to  $x \in X$ . Since  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  is a subsequence of itself, it must converge to  $x$ .



## Proof continued

( $\Rightarrow$ ) Suppose  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  converges to  $x \in X$ .  
Let  $(x_{n_k})_{k \in \mathbb{N}}$  be an arbitrary subsequence of  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ . Let  $\varepsilon > 0$  be arbitrary.  $\exists n_\varepsilon \in \mathbb{N}$  s.t.  $d(x_n, x) < \varepsilon \quad \forall n \geq n_\varepsilon$ . Choose  $k_\varepsilon$  such that  $n_{k_\varepsilon} \geq n_\varepsilon$  (this must exist since  $(n_k)_{k \in \mathbb{N}}$  is strictly increasing).  
Then  $\forall k \geq k_\varepsilon, d(x_{n_k}, x) < \varepsilon. \therefore x_{n_k} \rightarrow x$

# Continuity

## Definition

Let  $(X, d_X)$  and  $(Y, d_Y)$  be metric spaces, let  $x_0 \in X$ , and let  $f : X \rightarrow Y$ .  $f$  is *continuous* at  $x_0$  if for every sequence  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  in  $X$  that converges to  $x_0$ , we have  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} f(x_n) = f(x_0)$ .

We say that  $f$  is continuous if it is continuous at every point in  $X$ .



## Theorem

Let  $(X, d_X)$  and  $(Y, d_Y)$  be metric spaces, let  $x_0 \in X$ , and let  $f : X \rightarrow Y$ . The following are equivalent:

- (i)  $f$  is continuous at  $x_0$
- (ii) for all  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists  $\delta > 0$  such that  $d_Y(f(x), f(x_0)) < \epsilon$  for all  $x \in X$  with  $d_X(x, x_0) < \delta$
- (iii) for each  $\epsilon > 0$ , there is  $\delta > 0$  such that  $B_\delta(x_0) \subseteq f^{-1}(B_\epsilon(f(x_0)))$

(i)  $f$  is continuous at  $x_0$

(ii) for all  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists  $\delta > 0$  such that  $d_Y(f(x), f(x_0)) < \epsilon$  for all  $x \in X$  with

$d_X(x, x_0) < \delta$

Proof.

(i)  $\Rightarrow$  (ii) We prove the contrapositive.

$\exists \epsilon_0 > 0$  s.t.  $\forall \delta > 0 \exists x_\delta \in X$  with  $d_X(x_\delta, x_0) < \delta$   
but  $d_Y(f(x_\delta), f(x_0)) \geq \epsilon_0$

We need to find a sequence in  $X$  that converges to  $x_0$   
but the images do not converge.

Let  $\delta = \frac{1}{n}, n \in \mathbb{N}$ . We can pick a sequence  $x_n$  using  
(\*) which converges to  $x_0$ . For each  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  
 $d_Y(f(x_n), f(x_0)) \geq \epsilon_0$ . □

$\therefore \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} f(x_n) \neq f(x_0)$ .

(i)  $f$  is continuous at  $x_0$

(ii) for all  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists  $\delta > 0$  such that  $d_Y(f(x), f(x_0)) < \epsilon$  for all  $x \in X$  with  $d_X(x, x_0) < \delta$

(iii) for each  $\epsilon > 0$ , there is  $\delta > 0$  such that  $B_\delta(x_0) \subseteq f^{-1}(B_\epsilon(f(x_0)))$

### Proof continued

(ii)  $\Rightarrow$  (iii) Using the definition of pre-image & open ball

(iii)  $\Rightarrow$  (i) Let  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  be a sequence in  $X$  that converges to  $x_0$ . Let  $\epsilon > 0$ . By (iii),  $\exists \delta > 0$  s.t.  $B_\delta(x_0) \subseteq f^{-1}(B_\epsilon(f(x_0)))$ .

$\Rightarrow$  If  $x \in B_\delta(x_0)$ , then  $x$  is such that

$$d_Y(f(x_0), f(x)) < \epsilon.$$

Since  $(x_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$  converges,  $\exists N \in \mathbb{N}$  s.t.

$$d_X(x_n, x_0) < \delta, \text{ for } n \geq N$$

So by (iii),  $d_Y(f(x_0), f(x_n)) < \epsilon \forall n \geq N$ .

$$\therefore \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} f(x_n) = f(x_0).$$

### Corollary

Let  $(X, d_X)$  and  $(Y, d_Y)$  be metric spaces and let  $f : X \rightarrow Y$ . The following are equivalent:

- (i)  $f$  is continuous
- (ii) if  $U \subseteq Y$  is open, then  $f^{-1}(U)$  is open
- (iii) if  $F \subseteq Y$  is closed, then  $f^{-1}(F)$  is closed

We need the following results about sets and functions:

Let  $X$  and  $Y$  be sets and  $f : X \rightarrow Y$ . Let  $A, B \subseteq Y$ . Then

①  $A \subseteq B \Rightarrow f^{-1}(A) \subseteq f^{-1}(B)$  (corrected after lecture)

②  $f^{-1}(Y \setminus A) = X \setminus f^{-1}(A)$

### Proof.

Let  $(X, d_X)$  and  $(Y, d_Y)$  be metric spaces and let  $f : X \rightarrow Y$ .

(i)  $\Rightarrow$  (ii): Suppose  $f$  is continuous (at every point in  $X$ ) and let  $U \subseteq Y$ . Let  $x \in f^{-1}(U)$ . Then  $f(x) \in U$ .

Since  $U$  is open,  $\exists \varepsilon_0 > 0$  s.t.  $B_{\varepsilon_0}(f(x)) \subseteq U$ .

By the pr. thm (iii),  $\exists \delta_0 > 0$  s.t.  $B_{\delta_0}(x) \subseteq f^{-1}(B_{\varepsilon_0}(f(x)))$ .

Since  $B_{\varepsilon_0}(f(x)) \subseteq U$ ,  $f^{-1}(B_{\varepsilon_0}(f(x))) \subseteq f^{-1}(U)$ .

Thus for each  $x \in f^{-1}(U)$ ,  $\exists \delta_0 > 0$  s.t.

$$B_{\delta_0}(x) \subseteq f^{-1}(B_{\varepsilon_0}(f(x))) \subseteq f^{-1}(U)$$

$\therefore f^{-1}(U)$  is open.

### Proof continued

(ii)  $\Rightarrow$  (i) Let's use the def of continuity from pr. thm (iii).  
i.e for  $x \in X$ , for  $\varepsilon > 0 \exists \delta > 0$  s.t.  $B_\delta(x) \subseteq f^{-1}(B_\varepsilon(f(x)))$

Let  $x \in X$  and let  $\varepsilon > 0$  be arbitrary.

Since  $B_\varepsilon(f(x))$  is open, by (ii),  $f^{-1}(B_\varepsilon(f(x)))$   
is also open. Since  $x \in f^{-1}(B_\varepsilon(f(x)))$ , by  
def of open set,  $\exists \delta > 0$  s.t.  $B_\delta(x) \subseteq f^{-1}(B_\varepsilon(f(x)))$   
(ii)  $\Rightarrow$  (iii) We are done.

(ii)  $\Rightarrow$  (iii) Let  $F \subseteq Y$  be closed.

~~(iii)  $\Rightarrow$  (ii)~~

$\Rightarrow Y \setminus F$  is open

$\Rightarrow f^{-1}(Y \setminus F)$  is open by (ii)

Since  $f^{-1}(Y \setminus F) = X \setminus f^{-1}(F)$ ,  $f^{-1}(F)$   
is closed.

## Definition

Let  $(X, d_X)$  and  $(Y, d_Y)$  be metric spaces and let  $f : X \rightarrow Y$ .

- $f$  is *uniformly continuous* if for all  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists  $\delta > 0$  such that for every  $x_1, x_2 \in X$  with  $d_X(x_1, x_2) < \delta$ , we have  $d_Y(f(x_1), f(x_2)) < \epsilon$
- $f$  is *Lipschitz continuous* if there exists a  $K > 0$  such that for every  $x_1, x_2 \in X$  we have  $d_Y(f(x_1), f(x_2)) \leq Kd_X(x_1, x_2)$

## Proposition

Let  $(X, d_X)$  and  $(Y, d_Y)$  be metric spaces and let  $f : X \rightarrow Y$ .

$f$  is Lipschitz continuous  $\Rightarrow$   $f$  is uniformly continuous  $\Rightarrow$   $f$  is continuous

Proof is one of your exercises.

# Contraction Mapping Theorem

## Definition

Let  $(X, d)$  be a metric space and let  $f : X \rightarrow X$ . We say that  $x^* \in X$  is a **fixed point** of  $f$  if  $f(x^*) = x^*$ .

## Definition

Let  $(X, d)$  be a metric space and let  $f : X \rightarrow X$ .  $f$  is a **contraction** if there exists a constant  $k \in [0, 1)$  such that for all  $x, y \in X$ ,  $d(f(x), f(y)) \leq kd(x, y)$ .

Observe that a function is a contraction if and only if it is Lipschitz continuous with constant  $K < 1$ .

## Theorem (Contraction Mapping Theorem)

*Suppose that  $f : X \rightarrow X$  is a contraction and the metric space  $X$  is complete. Then  $f$  has a unique fixed point  $x^*$ .*



## Example

Let  $f : [-\frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{3}] \rightarrow [-\frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{3}]$  be defined by the mapping  $x \mapsto x^2$ . Assume we use the standard Euclidean metric,  $d(x, y) = |x - y|$ .  $f$  has a unique fixed point because

- $[-\frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{3}]$  is a complete metric space

- let  $x, y \in [-\frac{1}{3}, \frac{1}{3}]$ , then

$$|x^2 - y^2| = |x + y| |x - y| \leq \frac{2}{3} |x - y|$$

$\therefore f$  is a contraction with

$$K = 2/3$$

# References

Charles C. Pugh (2015). *Real Mathematical Analysis*. Undergraduate Texts in Mathematics. <https://link-springer-com.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/book/10.1007/978-3-319-17771-7>

Runde ,Volker (2005). *A Taste of Topology*. Universitext. url: <https://link.springer.com/book/10.1007/0-387-28387-0>

Zwiernik, Piotr (2022). *Lecture notes in Mathematics for Economics and Statistics*. url: <http://84.89.132.1/piotr/docs/RealAnalysisNotes.pdf>